

1 **AB617 Consultation Group**  
2 **Community Air Protection Blueprint Update Discussion**  
3 **August 5, 2020**

4 **List of Topics to Discuss for Inclusion in Update to Blueprint**

5  
6 Note: To develop this document, CARB staff started with the catalog of discussion topics  
7 reviewed and discussed at the Consultation Group's July 24, 2020 meeting, added new  
8 topics identified by the Group in that discussion, and finally added details under the topic  
9 from the flip chart notes of best practices developed at the Consultation Group's February  
10 2020 meeting.

11 **RESOURCES**

12 **Stipends**

- 13 • Provide stipends in accordance with CARB guidance to community members of steering
- 14 committees.
- 15 • Provide a floor amount that the districts can build upon.
- 16 • Amounts mentioned range \$50-State standard/ day (some include travel) – 1099
- 17 provided to everyone that receive over \$600/year. Stipends should be a respectful
- 18 amount.
- 19 • Will vouchers trigger tax liability
- 20 • Do not use community air grant funding for stipends.
- 21 • Look at Bay Area and Imperial examples of how to provide stipends.
- 22 • Work together to advocate for additional funding.

23 **Training**

- 24 • Training on effective community engagement, environmental justice, and racial equity in
- 25 order for CARB and air district staff to understand racial disparities and systemic racism.
- 26 • CARB to conduct more training throughout process, both in-person and through the
- 27 online Resource Center (including early Blueprint training to enhance community
- 28 capacity building prior to selection; key elements of the emission inventory; the role of
- 29 the Steering Committee; etc.)
- 30 • Special event training or summits on how to present information, including
- 31 understanding how people learn. Include topics on air quality, health impacts.
- 32 • Guidance on how to deal with data and monitoring in communities.

33 **Community tours**

- 34 • Recommend districts provide a community tour for Steering Committee members and
- 35 other stakeholders at the beginning of the process.
- 36 • Include youth members to be part of the discussion.

37 **Opportunities for Pre Selection Work**

- 38 • Identify opportunities for pre-selection work with community members prior to official
- 39 CARB selection.
- 40 • Avoid selection process forcing communities to compete against each other.

41 **CSC EARLY ACTIONS**

42 **Establishing a community boundary**

- 43 • Clarify the significance of selecting boundaries at the beginning of the process, including  
44 the role of the steering committee, and provide additional tools to support preliminary  
45 adoption of boundaries (including remote sensing maps of community).

46 **Establishing a Charter/Governance System**

- 47 • CSC Charters may include a clear decision-making process; a dispute resolution process;  
48 recommended practices to address potential conflicts of interest as well as the process  
49 for providing stipends.
- 50 • These practices may include:
- 51 ○ Clear expectations for codes of conduct;
  - 52 ○ Meeting discussion formats where all perspectives are heard and respected;
  - 53 ○ Providing information on principles of transparency and how to avoid conflicts of  
54 interest;
  - 55 ○ Collaborative leadership model

56 **Principles of open public meetings**

- 57 • Charter principles, policies, approaches to enable CSC members to participate in the  
58 public process, including subcommittees and other meetings [including Brown Act]

59 **PUBLIC PROCESS**

60 **Steering committee agenda setting**

- 61 • Joint CSC and District effort

62 **Timing and distribution of meeting materials**

- 63 • Districts to discuss with CSC members how to ensure transparency and accessibility  
64 during the Steering Committee process, including:
- 65 ○ How much time is needed to review documents.
  - 66 ○ Process to post materials after meetings (e.g. notes, videos, etc.); and
  - 67 ○ Process to provide meeting information (including video recordings) to those who  
68 are unable to attend in person.

69 **Meeting facilitation**

- 70 • Provide professional facilitation at CSC meetings, unless the CSC decides otherwise.

71 **Translation and interpretation services**

- 72 • Establish the translation and interpretation needs of the group.
- 73 • How much time it takes for translation and ensures that there is an understanding of  
74 what this timing does with regard to deadlines.

75 **Conflict of Interest, disclosure, and recusal**

- 76 • CSC Charters may include a clear decision-making process; a dispute resolution process;  
77 and recommended practices to address potential conflicts of interest.
- 78 • Providing information on how to avoid conflicts of interest;
- 79 • Include a definition of a community member.

- 80 • Providing mechanisms for members to share their affiliations and interests (e.g.,  
81 Acknowledging affiliations during steering committee discussions on relevant topics;  
82 Soliciting and posting short bios of steering committee members).

### 83 **CERP DEVELOPMENT**

#### 84 **Documenting the process**

- 85 • CERPs to list any CSC-identified strategies that were not included, the reason for  
86 exclusion, and any next steps.
- 87 • Districts should map their monitoring plans and/or emissions reduction programs back  
88 to Blueprint checklists
- 89 • Provide written responses for all comments received on program documents

#### 90 **Information for priority setting**

- 91 • Outline the community budget for CSC members (including funding for incentives, air  
92 monitoring, etc.)
- 93 • CARB to complete the emission inventory for each selected community, for increased  
94 consistency and to ensure that all sources are included.
- 95 • Forecasted emission inventories will be used for all community emissions reduction  
96 programs and clarify how a forecasted inventory will be interpreted.

#### 97 **Criteria for emission reduction targets, goals, and metrics**

- 98 • Revise criteria for emissions reduction targets, goals, and metrics

#### 99 **Strategies**

- 100 • Identify opportunities for new statewide emissions reduction strategies.
- 101 • Discuss opportunities to focus or expedite CARB mobile source strategies.
- 102 • Explore mechanisms to ensure CERPs include regulatory measures that go above and  
103 beyond those in existing plans and programs.
- 104 • Every CERP has substantial emission reductions
- 105 • Legal definition and description of the law or regulation in regard to the emissions  
106 reductions
- 107 • Clarify air district stationary source compliance assessment methodologies
- 108 • Exemptions and waivers in regulatory strategies

### 109 **ROLES/RESPONSIBILITIES**

#### 110 **CARB/District/CSC and Blueprint role**

- 111 • How to include Title VI principles; How to address racial grievances and disparities

#### 112 **Land use engagement mechanisms**

- 113 • CERPs to identify which land use, transportation, and mitigation strategies already have  
114 commitments from public agencies
- 115 • Identify the engagement mechanism that will be used to secure the commitments from  
116 the various organizations that have authority to implement CERP measures
- 117 • Expand land use assessment considerations and clarify land use strategy and  
118 engagement mechanisms.

### 119 **BLUEPRINT GENERAL**

- 120 • Remove uncertainty in the Blueprint
- 121 • What are the consequences for not following the Blueprint?
- 122 • Whistleblower Protection
- 123 • Toxics were missing, dioxins, furans were not monitored and have impacts
- 124 • Highlight Best Practice Models but allow for flexibility (use templates a guides)
- 125 • Incorporate process changes in resolutions and staff reports if not already done in
- 126 Advisory

## 127 **August 5, 2020 Topics from Letter Submitted by EJ Groups**

### 128 **Blueprint Update**

- 129 • Establish best practices for engagement through existing knowledge and processes, as
- 130 well by collaborating with community based organizations.
- 131 • Critical gap in Blueprint – lack of enforceability of adopted measures and of results from
- 132 the monitoring network.
- 133 • Blueprint update should be completed by the end of 2020
  - 134 ○ Initial guidance critical to Year 2 communities should be released by September,
  - 135 specifically CERP guidance and templates, including for monitoring plans
  - 136 ○ Blueprint should be updated on annual basis
  - 137 ○ CARB should facilitate a public process to review and refine recommendations
  - 138 ▪ Follow EJAC model
  - 139 ▪ Stipends should be provided

### 140 **Community Steering Committee Governance**

- 141 • Blueprint should include specific parameters for governance and accessibility of
- 142 Community Steering Committees
  - 143 ○ Committees should establish co-chairs who represent an environmental
  - 144 perspective and will have equal authority over planning and facilitation of
  - 145 meetings
  - 146 ○ CSCs should be empowered with formal decision making authority. A vote that
  - 147 achieves consensus or majority approval should be required at critical junctures
  - 148 ○ Clarify CARB role with regard to disagreements between air districts and CSCs
  - 149 and establish mechanisms for resolving disputes
    - 150 ▪ CERPs that are inadequate should be sent back to districts. Examples
    - 151 include a Plan not voted on by CSC, a Plan not translated into the primary
    - 152 language of CSC members or did not receive enough votes for CSC
    - 153 approval
    - 154 ▪ CARB should clarify that the Role of air district is to support the community
    - 155 leadership and decision making of the CSC
    - 156 ▪ CARB should clarify that districts do not have authority to dissolve CSCs
    - 157 ▪ Disputes must be resolved with agencies that have authority over
    - 158 pollutants of concerns that are unwilling to enforce adopted measures
- 159 • Establish policy defining stakeholder composition of CSCs and preventing conflicts of
- 160 interest
  - 161 ○ Regulated entities must be required to disclose conflicts and recuse themselves
  - 162 from votes in which they have a conflict of interest

- 163 ○ Request CSC member identify the financial interest that gives rise to the conflict
- 164 recuse themselves from the discussion, voting and leave the room until after the
- 165 matter is settled
- 166 ○ Documentation (disclosure forms) should be provided to air districts an annual
- 167 basis
- 168 ○ Conflict of Interest training should be provided
- 169 ● Provide compensation for community volunteers on CSC
- 170 ○ CARB to set minimum compensation amounts and funding should come from
- 171 implementation funds
- 172 ● CARB should establish best practices for community outreach and engagement
- 173 ● CARB must continue to build out planning and implementation processes for
- 174 communities that haven't been selected via the AB617 process in a way that equitably
- 175 distributes resources and synergizes collaboration among communities

### 176 **Community Emission Reduction Plan Guidance**

- 177 ● Blueprint needs improved structural guidance and models for CERPs
- 178 ○ Specific guidance and resources need to be developed for urban and rural areas
- 179 as well as unique delta and desert environments
- 180 ○ Prioritize enforceable, permanent quantifiable reductions that go above and
- 181 beyond existing regulations, plans and commitments
- 182     ▪ Emission factors should be included
- 183     ▪ Air Districts and CARB should build on and integrate guidance documents
- 184 such as OPR EJ Guidance for local general plan
- 185     ▪ Integrate concepts from CARBs freight handbook concept paper
- 186     ▪ Require district to adopt and implement direct reduction measures within
- 187 the AB617 community boundary before using incentive funding for
- 188 technology adoption or upgrades
- 189     ▪ Incentive funding should prioritize low income households and small local
- 190 businesses

### 191 **Best Practices for CERP Planning and Implementation**

- 192 ● Blueprint should set baseline of best practices for CERP development and
- 193 implementation processes
- 194 ○ CERPs to include all emissions and sources of concern regardless of jurisdiction,
- 195 including pesticides
- 196 ○ Clarify CARB role related to mobile sources, and what additional actions it will
- 197 take in AB617 communities
- 198 ○ Participation of CARB and Air District should not outnumber community
- 199 participants
- 200 ○ Regulatory agencies working on CAPP should be required to participate in
- 201 trainings on implicit bias and cultural humility at least once a year and when
- 202 possible in coordination with CAC participants
- 203 ○ External party should regularly evaluate CSC meetings and be accessible to CSC
- 204 participants as a type of "ombudsman" that can manage and respond to
- 205 complaints and concerns in real time, and should continue in an oversight role
- 206 through the implementation phase of the CERP

- 207 ○ Air districts must be required to use implementation funding for a minimum  
208 number of dedicated equity and environmental justice staff positions.

209 **Transparency in Resource and Budget Allocations**

- 210 ● CARB and air districts should provide annual reports, available to the public, with  
211 specific details on how AB617 spending is being expended, including analysis of how  
212 much funding is going to support requests from CSCs, how much is going toward  
213 monitoring equipment and incentive funding, how much money is spent on personnel  
214 and how much money is being used for direct reductions
- 215 ● CARB should establish a minimum percentage of funding earmarked for supporting  
216 community member’s ability to independently analyze and prioritize proposed reduction  
217 measures, including through funding independent convening where regulatory  
218 authorities and regulated entities are not present and/or by hiring technical experts not  
219 affiliated with regulatory authorities or regulated entities.
- 220 ● CARB should disallow use of fund for measures or projects that are not within the  
221 boundary of the identified AB 617 community
- 222 ● CARB should require that both purchase and placement of air monitors occur in  
223 consultation with CSCs
- 224 ● Implementation funding should be allocated to entities other than CARB and air districts  
225 that have jurisdiction over the target pollutant(s), to ensure implementation of reduction  
226 measures.

DRAFT