AB 617 Community Air Protection Program

***Annual Progress Reports for Community Emissions Reduction Programs***

**DRAFT Data Collection Template**

**DUE OCTOBER 1**

| **Air District**: | South Coast Air Quality Management District |
| --- | --- |
| **Community Name**: | San Bernardino, Muscoy |

**Reporting Requirement**: Assembly Bill (AB) 617 requires that air districts prepare an annual report for each community emissions reduction program.[[1]](#footnote-1)

**Data Collection**: This template is designed to collect the information that is needed to create the required annual reports and is not intended to act as a substitute for the annual reports. After the data are collected, it is expected that air districts will work with their community steering committees to compile the information into their own user‑friendly format(s) that reflects community concerns and summarizes progress, challenges, and next steps. California Air Resources Board (CARB) staff will compile data statewide to provide an overall update to CARB’s Governing Board and the public.

This data collection template includes: the metrics defined in each community emissions reduction program; action items from CARB Governing Board Resolutions and Staff Reports; and the minimum requirements listed in CARB’s Community Air Protection Blueprint.[[2]](#footnote-2) CARB staff will provide the relevant information on CARB strategies and associated emissions reduction progress for the annual reports. To support transparency, all information will be publicly available.

**Due Date for Public Release**: CARB’s Community Air Protection Blueprint states that annual progress reports must be made available to the public no later than October 1 of each year. Air districts must post the reports on their webpage, issue a public notification that the report has been released, and then present the report to the district board at a public hearing to discuss the contents.

***District Staff, please provide the following information for your OVERALL community emissions reduction program[[3]](#footnote-3)***

* Section A: *Qualitative* progress assessment and *quantitative* summary of progress for the ongoing work after air district Board approval; status updates for interim milestones identified by the CARB Governing Board Resolution at a future hearing to consider the community emissions reduction program

***Also, please fill in the attached spreadsheet to provide an update on each strategy in your community emissions reduction program***

* Section B: Status update for each strategy (attach spreadsheet)

| ***Section A:* QUALITATIVE progress assessment and status updates for interim milestones identified by the CARB Governing Board** |
| --- |
| 1. Provide a *qualitative* progress assessment. Briefly describe the progress made and provide a status update for each of the following items:*[Ref. Blueprint, page C-39, C-40]*
 |
| * Community Engagement.
 |
| *[Describe progress in community engagement and note any planned changes in public outreach activities]*Staff continues to engage with CSC members via email, telephone calls, newsletters, and CSC meetings. Staff has transitioned to a virtual format for community engagement due to the global pandemic.  |
| * Enforcement.
 |
| *[Describe progress in enforcement and note any new or revised enforcement activities]*During this reporting period, the Office of Compliance and Enforcement (OCE) conducted 113 inspections in the SBM community. Prior to the AB 617 program, the main source of public input on air pollution issues was from public complaints. However, the AB 617 CSC meetings provide communities an opportunity to identify and prioritize local air quality concerns. For example, the CERP actions regarding truck idling require agency-community partnership. South Coast AQMD receives relatively few idling truck complaints, yet truck idling was raised by the CSC as a key concern for all three Year 1 communities. In addition to the routine inspections and response from OCE staff, the actions included in the SBM CERP serve as enhanced enforcement efforts OCE staff have committed to completing during the five-year term of the plan. The following are air quality priorities in the SBM CERP and the enforcement efforts that were taken:* Cement/Asphalt Facilities – All the cement/asphalt facilities were inspected in 2019.
* Omnitrans – Both Omnitrans facilities have been inspected within the last year.
* Idling Trucks – All quarterly idling truck sweeps committed to in the CERP to date have been conducted, and these operations incorporate community input, fleet data, and historical locations where idling tends to occur.

Staff has made progress in each of the categories and will continue to do so in the future. In addition, the SBM CERP includes additional community outreach on the existing complaint system; thus, it is expected that the SBM community will continue to report any concerns occurring within the community.  |
| * Metrics for Tracking Progress.
 |
| *[Describe progress in identifying metrics to track progress for implementing the community emissions reduction program. Note any changes in the type of metrics being used or any new/updated data sources for assessing those metrics.]*Potential metrics for tracking progress may include the number of air filtration systems installed at schools within the SBM community, the number of mobile source incentive projects completed, stationary source incentive projects completed, or emission reductions achieved through rule development or equipment replacement. Further, the actions, goals and strategies in the CERPs prioritize emission reductions and set forth emission reduction targets for the milestone years 2024 and 2029 summarized in Table 1 – Overview of Emissions Reduction Targets (see Annual Progress Report) by 2029. The reporting period for this annual progress report is limited to less than nine months from the date the South Coast AQMD Governing Board adopted the CERPs. As implementation continues, South Coast AQMD staff will work with CARB staff, the AB 617 Technical Advisory Group, and CSC’s to quantify future emission reductions achieved by the CERP. |
| * Implementation Schedule.
 |
| *[Describe progress towards meeting the milestones in the implementation schedule. Note any changes to the implementation schedule or provide an updated implementation schedule as an attachment.]*Attachment A of the Annual Progress Report provides an update for those commitments or deliverables from September 6, 2020 and June 30, 2020. Key plan adjustments include updated timelines for Indirect Source Rules for Warehouses and Railyards. Chapter 5h contains the implementation schedule (SBM CERP Chapter 5h), with each course of action in the CERP scheduled to begin in a specified year, and/or quarter. Please refer to attached Section B (CARB SBM Excel Template) for status updates of individual actions, or milestones. |
| * Data Analysis.
 |
| *[Describe progress in data analysis here]*For the strategy of air monitoring, data analysis refers to assessing mobile measurements and fixed monitoring data/results to support implementation of emission reduction strategies and track their progress (see Air Monitoring section of the Annual Progress Report for SBM Community Air Monitoring Updates). For rule development, data analysis is part of the public process and is determined by the scope of the proposed rule or rule amendment (see Table 4 of the Annual Progress Report for the status of rules required to be considered for CERPs). |
| * Strategy Development.
 |
| *[Describe progress in strategy development here]*As these CERP actions are implemented, staff is continuing to receive input from the CSC to ensure the actions focus on the community’s concerns identified for the air quality priorities (e.g., the Truck Idling Location Prioritization and the Criteria for Air Filtration Systems). Strategies to address the air quality priorities are being followed as outlined in the CERP. However, strategies may be adjusted as South Coast AQMD receives new information about emissions from the efforts such as air monitoring or the deployment of ALPR systems. For a qualitative and quantitative status update of each action, please refer to Section B (CARB SBM Excel Template) attached. |
| 1. Highlight any “lessons learned” that can be used to support communities with similar sources and air quality challenges. *[Ref. Blueprint, page C-39]*
 |
| *[Describe lessons learned here]*During CERP development, some lessons learned included conveying mobile source and land use jurisdictional limitations from to the community. As an example, the community wanted to establish truck routes and policies for better warehouse design. Staff recognized a strong need for agency collaboration to circumnavigate these limitations. Staff established partnerships with entities such as the City of San Bernardino Planning Division, San Bernardino County Department of Public Health, CARB, Southern California Edison, and San Bernardino County Transportation Authority (SBCTA). During CERP implementation, lessons learned included the timing of CERP implementation efforts and opportunities. Below are examples:* Funding opportunities often have deadlines for allocation that may not align with the timelines for CERP actions. For instance, to ensure Community Air Protection Program (CAPP) funds would be requested, approved, and distributed by the deadline, staff felt a sense of urgency to provide the results of the School Prioritization Activity for additional CSC feedback. Staff wanted to provide sufficient time for CSC feedback.
* Technical and air quality related input provided to enhance land use policies is most effective when general plan and specific plan updates are occurring.
* Understanding the details of trucks idling (e.g., time of day, corner/parking lot, etc.) to coincide with compliance efforts on truck idling sweeps

Another lesson learned is the challenge with gathering CSC input to guide implementation of actions that require further detail. Specifically, staff conducted two activities using worksheets at CSC meetings that returned different results. The Truck Idling Location Prioritization Activity resulted in one worksheet submission from the CSC meeting. Staff subsequently called CSC members to solicit additional input; however, no additional worksheets were submitted. With the Criteria for Air Filtration Systems Activity, 14 worksheets were received from the CSC meeting. The worksheets differed in the request for CSC input with the Truck Idling Location Prioritization Worksheet requiring descriptive details, and the Criteria for Air Filtration Systems Worksheet requiring a ranking. Staff will continue to work on improving methods to solicit CSC input.  |
| 1. The community emissions reduction program will have included a community profile. Describe any community profile updates, such as the following information, if applicable: *[Ref. Blueprint, page C-39]*
 |
| 3a) Describe changes in community attributes (e.g., revised socioeconomic data). |
| *[Describe changes in community attributes here]*No changes in community attributes have been identified between September 6, 2019 through June 30, 2020. |
| 3b) List any new community attributes that have been identified (e.g., new local public health indicators). |
| *[List new community attributes here]*No additional community attributes have been identified between September 6, 2019 through June 30, 2020. |
| 1. The South Coast AQMD Governing Board held a Board Meeting and approved Resolution 19-28, including the following action item[[4]](#footnote-4):
 |
| **Action Item in SCAQMD Board Resolution 19-28*** SCAQMD Board-Directed Action: The South Coast AQMD Governing Board directs staff to periodically report to the Stationary Source Committee on the implementation of the SBM CERP, including updates on the actions within the plan and the emissions reductions achieved.
 |
| *[Describe reports to the South Coast AQMD Stationary Source Committee]*There have been no reports to the South Coast AQMD Stationary Source Staff updated the Stationary Source Committee during the September 18, 2020 meeting. This update included progress on implementation and the impacts of COVID-19. Staff presented an overview of the 2019-2020 Draft Annual Progress Report for AB 617 Community Emissions Reduction Plans. Staff fielded questions from committee members and members of the public.  |
| 1. AB 617 requires that all community emissions reduction programs be submitted to the CARB Governing Board for review and approval.[[5]](#footnote-5) In preparation for consideration by the Governing Board, CARB staff reviewed the SBM CERP and provided a Staff Report for Board consideration. Provided below are recommended actions specified in the Staff Report.[[6]](#footnote-6) Please use the form below or provide an attachment that describes updates related to the following recommended actions:
 |
| **Recommended Actions in CARB Staff Report*** Reduction Strategies: To help clarify and enhance implementation, staff recommends that the Board direct CARB staff to work with South Coast AQMD and the community steering committee to undertake the following actions during the Plan implementation process:
* Recommended Action #1: Prioritize project types for incentive funding based on steering committee recommendations, including the use of zero emission technologies, where feasible, and identify funding sources for incentive-based and other strategies, including AB 617 incentive funds.
 |
| *[Describe the prioritization of incentive projects based on steering committee recommendations]*South Coast AQMD prioritizes eligible projects in AB 617 communities based on a process that identifies and prioritizes zero-emission projects followed by projects using the cleanest available technologies.  |
| * Recommended Action #2: Define implementation steps and milestones for Plan actions that require further detail such as incentive funding, outreach, and exposure reduction measures for specified sensitive receptors in order to provide additional clarity on how these actions will be implemented.
 |
| *[Describe how implementation steps and milestones were defined]*CERP actions that require further detail to implement are being evaluated by staff to define implementation steps and milestones. Regarding incentive funding, staff adheres to the implementation steps and milestones established for Carl Moyer Program and Prop 1B guidelines, both of which are the framework used for AB 617 project evaluations; staff will continue to follow programmatic milestones in its implementation process. For outreach and exposure reduction actions, staff is working to define the implementation steps and milestones based on CSC input and outreach to responsible entities in the CERP to gather baseline and technical information.  |
| * Recommended Action #3: Refine metrics for tracking progress to establish what constitutes a successful action.
 |
| *[Describe how metrics have been refined for tracking progress]*A successful action is constituted by a commitment in the CERP being implemented within the anticipated implementation timeline with measurable achievements (e.g., emission reductions). Metrics have been refined in various ways during CERP implementation. As an example, actions related to incentives have been further refined by staff tracking contract reimbursements upon project completion and emission reductions through annual reporting. Enforcement actions such as quarterly idling sweeps have commenced, and the results of those sweeps are used to guide future enforcement actions. Metrics associated with these idling sweeps include number of inspections, number of non-compliant and idle-compliant trucks, average age of trucks that frequent the community, etc. Exposure reduction metrics have been refined by community input through outreach events, CSC worksheet activities, and other forms of public engagement. An additional metric, such as number of air filtration systems installed in schools, is currently being refined, as South Coast AQMD requested funding for the first ten schools on the prioritized list of schools to receive air filtration systems. Upon successful disbursement of these funds, additional targets or refined metrics may result to further ensure the implementation of this action. Additionally, staff will continue to seek funding for various actions (e.g., tree planting, air and home filtration systems, etc.) that will assist in identifying additional metrics to track progress. |
| * Recommended Action #4: Update the emissions reduction targets as new information becomes available for the regulatory and other strategies that currently do not have defined benefits.
 |
| *[Describe updated emissions reduction targets here or provide an attachment]*New information is not available at this time. |
| * Mobile and Indirect Sources: To further support and enhance implementation, staff recommends that the Board direct CARB staff to work with South Coast AQMD to undertake the following actions during the Plan implementation process:
* Recommended Action #5: Provide ongoing reports back to the steering committee on collaboration with other agencies for designating truck routes and parking away from sensitive receptors.
 |
| *[Describe reports back to the steering committee on truck routes and parking]*There have been no reports back to the steering committee on collaboration with other agencies for designating truck routes and parking away from sensitive receptors. South Coast AQMD and CARB enforcement are working together to receive approval from schools, and municipalities to install “no idling” signs near these sensitive receptors to prevent idling*.* |
| * Recommended Action #6: Continue work on reducing impacts from warehouse facilities and railyards, with consideration of any additional mechanisms that may be needed to ensure anticipated exposure reductions are achieved.
 |
| *[Describe work on reducing impacts from railyards]*Staff held two joint CARB/South Coast AQMD community meetings to discuss potential regulatory concepts for Railyard ISR. South Coast AQMD is pursuing four concepts to reduce emissions from railyards, including developing an Indirect Source Rule (ISR). These include:* Reducing exposures from locomotive maintenance and service emissions
* Requiring railroads to develop zero emission infrastructure plans for railyards
* Developing new incentive programs to focus on incentivizing cleaner locomotive activity instead of cleaner locomotive purchases
* Evaluating new monitoring approaches for in-use locomotives
 |
| * Recommended Action #7: Work with the steering committee to advance implementation of the strategies outlined in the Freight Handbook Concept Paper in the community.
 |
| *[Describe work with the steering committee on strategies in Freight Handbook Concept Paper]*On December 12, 2019, CARB staff released a concept paper for the Freight Handbook. South Coast AQMD provided comments to CARB regarding this concept paper. Further development of the concept paper is pending further action by CARB staff. |
| * Ensuring Effective Enforcement
* Recommended Action #8: Review the results of South Coast AQMD and CARB’s enhanced enforcement activities with the community steering committee, discuss the steps taken to address any issues identified, and identify appropriate refinements to the focused enforcement activities within the community.
 |
| *[Describe discussions with the steering committee on enhanced enforcement]*The enhanced enforcement commitments in the CERP are designed to address local level air pollution concerns regarding the identified air quality priorities for each community. The “report backs” are discussions with the community regarding some of those commitments, with the focus being either (a) receiving community input to refine or improve the approach for an identified goal/commitment or (b) informing the CSC of particular findings or results. Staff has participated in both types of discussions with the SBM CSC; and while timelines are described in the CERP, these updates can also occur on an as-needed basis. For example, the CSC was updated when the OCE staff took enforcement action on a truck idling next to a school, and updates were provided on Truck Idling Enforcement in October 2019 as committed in the CERP. In addition, when CSC members raise specific air pollution concerns regarding a facility or event, that information is forwarded to assigned OCE staff for evaluation. The formal process described above for community input, implementation, and open discussion and reevaluation with community members is a key component of enhanced enforcement Additional refinements may include increasing the number of compliance report backs, where further input can be solicited as to what community members see day to day in their neighborhoods, thereby allowing more timely evaluation of enforcement approaches. |
| * Community-Level Technical Foundation
* Recommended Action #9: Continue community air monitoring and the ongoing process to improve emissions inventory and air quality modeling by incorporating the newest resources and tools as they become available as part of Plan implementation and to characterize current air quality in the community.
 |
| *[Describe actions to improve the community-level technical foundation (community air monitoring, emissions inventory, air quality modeling) or provide an attachment]*Data collected from air monitoring can provide valuable information about sources of air pollution, types of pollutants, and air quality impacts in AB 617 communities. Monitoring data resulting from the implementation of the CAMPs also supports CERP implementation. To keep CSC’s informed of monitoring conducted for the CAMP and CERP, South Coast AQMD staff developed infographics that track the progress of monitoring activities (SBM – <http://www.aqmd.gov/ab-617/CAMP/infographics/SBM>).  |

| ***Section A:* QUANTITATIVE Summary of progress for the community emissions reduction program** |
| --- |
| 1. Status of the Strategies Included in the Program – Summarize the total number of strategies that have been fully implemented, the number that are in progress, and the number that have not yet begun implementation. *[Ref. Blueprint pages C-38, C-39. San Bernardino, Muscoy Plan, Chapter 5]*
 |
| *[Summarize the number of implemented strategies, the number in progress, and the number not yet begun]*This report reflects the progress plan adoption, September 6, 2019 to June 30, 2020. Staff established estimated timelines to determine when the action goals would begin implementation. Approximately 22 of 32 commitments or deliverables from the SBM CERP have been initiated and/or are in the process of implementation. Two commitments were completed by June 30, 2020. Not all commitments or deliverables were given with estimated timelines set during this timeframe. All of the actions within the CERP are expected to be fully implemented over the five-year term of the plan.  |
| 1. Completion of Required Elements – Describe completion of required elements (e.g., emissions reduction targets, milestones for compliance goals, etc.). Some required elements are provided below in 7a, 7b, and 7c.*[Ref. Blueprint pages C-3, C-4, C-38, C-40.*

7a) Emission Reduction Targets – Summarize progress toward achieving overall emission reduction targets (PM2.5, PM10, DPM, NOX, and VOC, as applicable). *[Ref. Blueprint pages C-16 to C-19, C-38, C-40. San Bernardino, Muscoy Plan, Chapter 5a, Table 5a-1]* |
| *[Summarize progress toward overall emission reduction targets]*Progress in achieving overall emission reductions, listed in Chapter 5a, Table 5a-1 of the SBM CERP, is obtained through rule development and incentives. The rules and regulations included within Table 5a-2 have not completed their respective rule/regulation development public process during this timeframe. Stationary source rule development projects will provide their final proposed emission reductions at the time of their public hearing (Governing Board consideration). The expected annual emission reductions from incentive projects for this community is 79.7 tons per year (TPY) (NOx), 1.3 TPY (DPM), and 2.3 TPY (ROG). Incentives staff is currently working to finalize contracts and completion of projects. South Coast AQMD has thus met 106% of its 2024 emission reduction goal for NOx and 151% for DPM. In addition, some progress toward overall emission reduction targets is still to be determined (see attached Section B – CARB SBM Excel Template). |
| 7b) Proximity-Based Goals - Summarize progress toward achieving proximity-based goals (e.g., for air filtration, urban greening, school flag programs). *[Ref.  Blueprint pages C-19, C-20. San Bernardino, Muscoy Plan, Chapter 5g]* |
| *[Summarize progress toward achieving proximity-based goals]*The various actions related towards achieving proximity-based goals requires ongoing coordination throughout the term of the plan. For example, staff worked with the CSC to establish criteria to develop a prioritized list of schools to receive air filtration systems as funding becomes available. Staff has conducted a Criteria for Air Filtration Systems Activity and used CSC input provided from worksheets to establish criteria to generate a prioritized list of schools for installation of air filtration systems. Staff then requested CAPP funds from CARB to begin installation efforts at the first 10 schools on the prioritized list. SBM also has three schools in South Coast AQMD’s Why Healthy Air Matters (WHAM) program. |
| 7c) Compliance Goals - Provide an update on progress toward achieving compliance goals and improving compliance (e.g., summarize non-compliance rates and other key compliance statistics). *[Ref. Blueprint page C-31. San Bernardino, Muscoy Plan, Chapter 5]* |
| *[Provide an update on compliance goals here]*See Section B (CARB SBM Excel Template attached) for details about the progress toward compliance goals and improvements. For all CERP actions, OCE has made progress in conducting field activities and in taking enforcement action, as appropriate. Section B provides details on various key compliance statistics relating to the goals identified in the CERP. Additional refinements to enforcement efforts and commitments may include increasing the number of compliance report backs regarding regular compliance-related activities, such as complaint response, evaluating and addressing notifications (e.g., equipment breakdowns), facility inspections, surveillance operations, and various other daily functions carried out by OCE staff. |
| 1. Incentives Investments - Summarize the total incentives investments for programs that are identified in the community emissions reduction program or for other projects that provide air quality benefits within the community.
 |
| *[Summarize total incentives investments and associated emission reductions in the community, in coordination with CARB staff]*To date, the total investment in incentives for SBM is approximately $9.6M, resulting in 79.7 TPY (NOx), 1.3 TPY (DPM) and 2.3 TPY (ROG) in emission reduction benefits to the community. Additional emission reductions may further benefit the community pending implementation of subsequent incentive programs. |

| ***Section B:* Status update for EACH STRATEGY in the community emissions reduction program** |
| --- |
| Please fill in the attached spreadsheet template and provide an update on the status and specific metrics for EACH STRATEGY. [Ref. Blueprint, page C-39] |
| *[Use the attached spreadsheet to provide updates on each strategy]* |

**[ATTACH SPREADSHEET FOR *Report Section B:* Status update for EACH STRATEGY in the community emissions reduction program]**

1. Assembly Bill 617, Garcia, C., Chapter 136, Statutes of 2017; codified in California Health and Safety Code section 44391.2(c)(7) which states that each district “…shall prepare an annual report summarizing the results and actions taken to further reduce emissions, pursuant to the community emissions reduction program…” [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. California Air Resources Board, “Community Air Protection Blueprint”, October 2018, Appendix C, pages C-38 to C‑40, available at: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/our-work/programs/community-air-protection-program/community-air-protection-blueprint> [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
3. South Coast Air Quality Management District, “Assembly Bill (AB) 617 Community Air Initiatives, Community Emissions Reduction Plan, San Bernardino, Muscoy“ (i.e., San Bernardino, Muscoy Plan), September 2019, available at: <http://www.aqmd.gov/nav/about/initiatives/community-efforts/environmental-justice/ab617-134/san-b/cerp-docs>. [↑](#footnote-ref-3)
4. South Coast Air Quality Management District, Governing Board Resolution 19-28, approved at a Board Meeting on September 6, 2019, available at: <http://www.aqmd.gov/nav/about/initiatives/community-efforts/environmental-justice/ab617-134/san-b/cerp-docs>. [↑](#footnote-ref-4)
5. California Health and Safety Code section 44391.2(c)(4). [↑](#footnote-ref-5)
6. CARB document “San Bernardino, Muscoy, Community Emissions Reduction Program Staff Report” released March 26, 2020, available at: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/resources/documents/san-bernardino-muscoy-community-emissions-reduction-program-staff-report>. [↑](#footnote-ref-6)