

## Consultation Group Meeting #2 Chat record (original)

01:03:41 Maximilian Rosa: We hear every paper rattle and whisper.

01:03:55 Brian Moore | CARB: Welcome, here is the link again to today's meeting materials:

Meeting webpage:

<https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/events/cap-program-CG-Dec3-2025>

01:05:37 Jasmine Elisa Beltran -SELA.AB617: I am here

01:05:58 Jasmine Elisa Beltran -SELA.AB617: having technical problems but I'm here

01:07:00 Maximilian Rosa: You can add Max as my alternative first name.

01:12:44 Brian Moore | CARB: Here is a direct link to the agenda:

[https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/2025-11/2025\\_1203\\_CG\\_Agenda\\_Final.pdf](https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/2025-11/2025_1203_CG_Agenda_Final.pdf)

01:13:00 Maximilian Rosa: Ill go with Peter Cat Recording Company or Thievery Corporation for favorite band. I mostly listen to rap and there aren't a lot of rap bands.

01:14:07 Michelle Byars - CARB: Good morning! Just letting you know that there will be public comment periods periodically. Or did you need technical help?

01:15:05 Brian Moore | CARB: @Maximilian: Thievery Corporation is great! Wow blast from past. I need to dive back into their catalog.

01:16:41 Brian Moore | CARB: Here is a link to last meeting's summary document:  
<https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/2025-10/DRAFT%20Consultation%20Group%20Meeting%20Summary%209.8.25.pdf>

01:17:17 Brian Moore | CARB: 🍷

01:21:02 Mary Elizabeth, Stockton AB617 Steering Committee Member: Talking Heads and Bruce Cockburn :) I wish the other favorite band shared was written to check out too.

01:24:17 Michelle Byars - CARB: From Mary Elizabeth... Talking Heads and Bruce Cockburn :) I wish the other favorite band shared was written to check out too.

01:24:36 Michelle Byars - CARB: from Brian Moore... @Maximilian: Thievery Corporation is great! Wow blast from past. I need to dive back into their catalog.

01:25:33 Michelle Byars - CARB: From Maximillian Rosa... Ill go with Peter Cat Recording Company or Thievery Corporation for favorite band. I mostly listen to rap and there aren't a lot of rap bands.

01:25:48 Michelle Byars - CARB: Sorry for the backwards copy of that conversation.

01:26:54 Michelle Byars - CARB: Everyone, please remember that this is a public forum. All messages sent to hosts and panelists will be copied and shared out for transparency. Send chat messages to "Everyone".

01:27:36 Mary Elizabeth, Stockton AB617 Steering Committee Member: Maybe add the presenter(s) names to the agenda items.

01:28:39 Michelle Byars - CARB: from Mary Elizabeth... "Maybe add the presenter(s) names to the agenda items."

01:29:10 Brian Moore | CARB: Charter with comments:  
[https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/2025-11/AB617\\_CG\\_DRAFT%20FINAL-Charter\\_color%20coded\\_COMMENTtable.pdf](https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/2025-11/AB617_CG_DRAFT%20FINAL-Charter_color%20coded_COMMENTtable.pdf)

01:29:24 Brian Moore | CARB: Charter comment spreadsheet:  
<https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/2025-11/All%20Comments%20on%20Consultation%20Group%20Charter.pdf>

01:43:43 Brian Moore | CARB: Color-coded charter with comments:  
[https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/2025-11/AB617\\_CG\\_DRAFT%20FINAL-Charter\\_color%20coded\\_COMMENTtable.pdf](https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/2025-11/AB617_CG_DRAFT%20FINAL-Charter_color%20coded_COMMENTtable.pdf)

01:44:12 Dr. Jonathan London: Here is a great resource on the history of the EJ movement in CA: <https://www.ucpress.edu/books/evolution-of-a-movement/paper>

01:46:22 Dr. Jonathan London: The background section could cite my team's evaluations of AB 617 if that were useful.

01:50:38 Mary Elizabeth, Stockton AB617 Steering Committee Member: In the Fall of 2021, a subgroup of environmental justice leaders on the Consultation Group, with facilitation and writing support of CARB, wrote the People's Blueprint that highlights equity, environmental justice, benefits of the co-leadership model, and recommendations to strengthen transparency and accountability for the Program. Name out the subgroup!

01:50:40 Michelle Byars - CARB: From Brian Moore... Color-coded charter with comments: [https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/2025-11/AB617\\_CG\\_DRAFT%20FINAL-Charter\\_color%20coded\\_COMMENTtable.pdf](https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/2025-11/AB617_CG_DRAFT%20FINAL-Charter_color%20coded_COMMENTtable.pdf)

01:50:58 Michelle Byars - CARB: From Jonathan London... Here is a great resource on the history of the EJ movement in CA: <https://www.ucpress.edu/books/evolution-of-a-movement/paper>

01:51:21 Michelle Byars - CARB: From Jonathan London... The background section could cite my team's evaluations of AB 617 if that were useful.

01:51:59 Michelle Byars - CARB: From Mary Elizabeth... In the Fall of 2021, a subgroup of environmental justice leaders on the Consultation Group, with facilitation and writing support of CARB, wrote the People's Blueprint that highlights equity, environmental justice, benefits of the co-leadership model, and recommendations to strengthen transparency and accountability for the Program. Name out the subgroup!

01:53:24 Michelle Byars - CARB: From Mary Elizabeth... Please consider with this live document that the changes are documented by edit date.

02:00:25 Michelle Byars - CARB: If you see any issues with this attendance list, please contact Michelle Byars on chat or by email at [michelle.byars@arb.ca.gov](mailto:michelle.byars@arb.ca.gov).

02:10:22 Michelle Byars - CARB: Rodney Andrews V -Virtual

Dr. Alberto Ayala NP -Not Present

Janice Lam Snyder AIP -Alternate In-Person

Bishop Chris Baker NP -Not Present

Dr. John Balmes IP -In-Person

Diane Takvorian IP -In-Person

Jasmine Beltran V -Virtual

Y'Anad Burrell IP In-Person

BK White NP -Not Present

Tim Carmichael IP -In-Person

Prithvi Deore IP -In-Person

Scott Strelecki NP -Not Present

Mary Elizabeth V -Virtual

Margo Praus AV -Alternate Virtual

Kevin Hamilton NP -Not Present

Ryan Hayashi IP -In-Person  
Stephanie Ng AIP -Alternate In-Person  
Dr. Anissa Heard-Johnson IP -In-Person  
Walter Shen AIP -Alternate In-Person  
Belen Leon-Lopez IP -In-Person  
Israel Hernandez NP -Not Present  
Dr. David Lo IP -In-Person  
Dr. Jonathan London V -Virtual  
Cassie Lopina V -Virtual  
Mary Solecki NP -Not Present...  
02:10:26 Michelle Byars - CARB: Arsenio Mataka NP Not Present  
Dr. Philip Fine NP Not Present  
Kevin McKernan NP Not Present  
Antoinette Meier NP Not Present  
Kirsten Uchitel AV Alternate Virtual  
Baldwin Moy NP Not Present  
Mari Nambo-Ramirez AV Alternate Virtual  
Dirk Piersma IP-In-Person  
Maximilian Rosa AV Alternate Virtual  
Dr. Rebecca E. Skinner AIP -Alternate In-Person  
Paula Torrado Plazas NP -Not Present  
Mary Valdemar IP -In-Person  
Domingo Vigil IP In-Person  
Shalem Aboody-Lopez NP Not Present  
Christine Zimmerman AV Alternate Virtual  
Bob Brown NP Not Present

02:10:33 Mary Elizabeth, Stockton AB617 Steering Committee Member: at least annually survey CSCs and greater audience?

02:10:54 Michelle Byars - CARB: From Mary Elizabeth... at least annually survey CSCs and greater audience

02:32:20 Dr. Jonathan London: Re: Dr. Cessa's comment on trauma-informed process: <https://www.ctipp.org/post/guide-to-trauma-informed-meetings-discussions-conversations>

02:32:34 Michelle Byars - CARB: From Jonathan London... Re: Dr. Cessa's comment on trauma-informed process: <https://www.ctipp.org/post/guide-to-trauma-informed-meetings-discussions-conversations>

03:03:39 Brian Moore | CARB: Scroll down to see cg member affiliations.

<https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/capp/mdc/abcg/community-air-protection-program-consultation-group>

03:04:58 Brian Moore | CARB: Charter comment spreadsheet: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/2025-11/All%20Comments%20on%20Consultation%20Group%20Charter.pdf>

03:06:27 Brian Moore | CARB: Color-coded charter with comments: [https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/2025-11/AB617\\_CG\\_DRAFT%20FINAL-Charter\\_color%20coded\\_COMMENTtable.pdf](https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/2025-11/AB617_CG_DRAFT%20FINAL-Charter_color%20coded_COMMENTtable.pdf)

03:18:48 Arsenio Mataka - Bay Area Air District: Are we at break?

03:19:36 Brian Moore | CARB: Femi showing up for lunch. ;)

03:21:20 Michelle Byars - CARB: Just noting we have approximately 20 public members attending online.

04:18:57 EloyFlores: 15 minutes

04:37:57 Deldi Reyes, she, her/s: hello everyone, we're back

04:49:10 Cassie Lopina: I am here - I apologize for missing roll call!

04:50:34 Michelle Byars - CARB: From Cassie Lopina... I am here - I apologize for missing roll call!

04:53:08 Dr. Jonathan London: On Mary V's comment about mislabeling non-violent protest: <https://www.whitehouse.gov/presidential-actions/2025/09/countering-domestic-terrorism-and-organized-political-violence/>

04:53:28 Michelle Byars - CARB: From Jonathan London... On Mary V's comment about mislabeling non-violent protest: <https://www.whitehouse.gov/presidential-actions/2025/09/countering-domestic-terrorism-and-organized-political-violence/>

05:06:42 Dr. Jonathan London: I love Mary V's suggestion of cross-learning from CARB and other BDO's EJ advisory committee. I wonder if CARB could convene an informal (non-decision-making) meeting of members of these different advisory committees to share experiences, lessons learned and recommendations for on-going improvement. This would be outside of the scope of the CG itself.

05:09:15 Rodney Andrews: Health & Safety Code § 39603 and Gov. Code § 11564.5, does not

adequately compensate members for meetings that often exceed three hour

05:11:13 Michelle Byars - CARB: From Jonathan London... I love Mary V's suggestion of cross-learning from CARB and other BDO's EJ advisory committee. I wonder if CARB could convene an informal (non-decision-making) meeting of members of these different advisory committees to share experiences, lessons learned and recommendations for on-going improvement. This would be outside of the scope of the CG itself.

05:11:39 Michelle Byars - CARB: From Rodney Andrews... Health & Safety Code § 39603 and Gov. Code § 11564.5, does not

adequately compensate members for meetings that often exceed three hour

05:11:49 Deldi Reyes, she, her/s:

[https://leginfo.legislature.ca.gov/faces/codes\\_displaySection.xhtml?lawCode=HSC&sectionNum=39603](https://leginfo.legislature.ca.gov/faces/codes_displaySection.xhtml?lawCode=HSC&sectionNum=39603).

05:11:57 Rodney Andrews: thanks

05:12:21 Michelle Byars - CARB: From Deldi Reyes...

[https://leginfo.legislature.ca.gov/faces/codes\\_displaySection.xhtml?lawCode=HSC&sectionNum=39603](https://leginfo.legislature.ca.gov/faces/codes_displaySection.xhtml?lawCode=HSC&sectionNum=39603).

05:12:25 Kevin Hamilton: Legal will have the final word here.

05:12:44 Deldi Reyes, she, her/s: Rodney if you can help us out and point me to where you see the four hours referenced, that would be great and thank you.

05:12:50 Michelle Byars - CARB: From Rodney Andrews... thanks

05:13:03 Michelle Byars - CARB: From Kevin Hamilton... Legal will have the final word here.

05:13:19 Michelle Byars - CARB: From Deldi Reyes... Rodney if you can help us out and point me to where you see the four hours referenced, that would be great and thank you.

05:15:16 Michelle Byars - CARB: Please use the drop down in blue, within this chat box, to select and send messages to "Everyone"

05:25:41 Brian Moore | CARB: Link to the document shown on screen:  
<https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/2025-11/Consultation%20Group%20Meeting%20Agreements%20and%20Goal%20Statements%20Grouped%20by%20Theme%202.pdf>

05:34:17 Mary Elizabeth, Stockton AB617 Steering Committee Member: Polls?

05:35:47 Deldi Reyes, she, her/s: Yes, we can do polls as long as poll respondents' names are shown

05:39:40 Dr. Rebecca E. Skinner: popsicle

05:40:32 Deldi Reyes, she, her/s: ryan

05:40:49 Michelle Byars - CARB: From Dr. Rebecca Skinner... popsicle

05:51:08 Mary Elizabeth, Stockton AB617 Steering Committee Member: I know - when is there a public comment?

05:52:40 Kevin Olp | CARB (he/him): After we establish the ad hoc

05:52:59 Michelle Byars - CARB: From Kevin Olp... After we establish the ad hoc

05:53:00 Kevin Olp | CARB (he/him): Thank you for your patience Margo, this was a long agenda item

05:53:25 Michelle Byars - CARB: From Kevin Olp... Thank you for your patience Margo, this was a long agenda item

00:59:43 Mary Elizabeth, Stockton AB617 Steering Committee Member: I don't know what progressive staff means?

01:00:00 Mary Elizabeth, Stockton AB617 Steering Committee Member: Or stack?

01:00:40 Dr. Jonathan London: The progressive stack relates to the "community first" agreement. Could be combined or linked?

01:00:55 Dr. Jonathan London: And, I'd love to get Mary's training!

01:01:03 Michelle Byars - CARB: From Jonathan London... The progressive stack relates to the “community first” agreement. Could be combined or linked?

01:01:36 Brian Moore | CARB: Goals by theme on page 4 of this document:  
<https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/2025-11/Consultation%20Group%20Meeting%20Agreements%20and%20Goal%20Statements%20Grouped%20by%20Theme%202.pdf>

01:03:01 Michelle Byars - CARB: From Jonathan London... And, I’d love to get Mary’s training!

01:19:36 Mary Elizabeth, Stockton AB617 Steering Committee Member: Thank you Kevin.

01:22:08 Brian Moore | CARB: Blueprint 2,0 link:  
<https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/capp/mdc/bp2/community-air-protection-program-blueprint-20>

01:32:28 Deldi Reyes, she, her/s: Absolutely

01:33:32 Brian Moore | CARB: Program Progress Update Document for all to check out:

[https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/2025-11/CAPP%20Progress%20Update%20Dec\\_2025%20DRAFT.pdf](https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/2025-11/CAPP%20Progress%20Update%20Dec_2025%20DRAFT.pdf)

01:42:57 Kevin Hamilton: Thank you CARB staff!!!

01:45:56 Christine Zimmerman: Thank you, everyone, for a great discussion. I learn from you all and missed seeing you in person.

01:46:15 Deldi Reyes, she, her/s: Thank you Cassie

01:46:19 Dr. Rebecca E. Skinner: Thank you everyone for a fascinating meeting!

01:46:21 Michelle Byars - CARB: From Kevin Hamilton... Thank you CARB staff!!!

01:46:37 Michelle Byars - CARB: From Dr. Rebecca Skinner... Thank you everyone for a fascinating meeting!